

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 26.3 that were submitted as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by SFPD, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 26.3:

The SFPD should implement an immediate public education campaign on the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct as centered on anti-bias and the initiatives underway.

Response to 26.3:

SFPD has developed a public education campaign on the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct, with a focus on its commitment to anti-biased policing. First, SFPD's Media Relations Unit (MRU) runs an outreach campaign on a quarterly basis to disseminate information to the public (in English, Spanish, and Chinese) on how to file a complaint against an officer. The MRU disseminates this information on social media platforms, including Facebook. The MRU also distributes the same information to district station captains to provide at stations and in station newsletters. Finally, the MRU also publicizes on social media a link to SFPD's webpage on complaints that are sustained by Internal Affairs, which is another way to inform the public about the processes SFPD has in place to address officer misconduct.

On a semi-annual basis, the district station captains must present information related to bias-free policing during their monthly community meetings and in their newsletters. In those meetings and in the newsletters, the district station captains must (1) present information related to SFPD's department general orders (DGOs) related to bias, including its policy prohibiting biased policing (DGO 5.17) and its policy on complaints against officers (DGO 2.04) and (2) explain the process to commend or complain about an officer's conduct.

SFPD also launched a new website in 2019, which includes a page dedicated to discussing "Bias-Free Policing." On that page, SFPD provides the public with links to department general orders (DGOs) related to bias, including its policy prohibiting biased policing (DGO 5.17) and its policy on complaints against officers (DGO 2.04). SFPD includes other information on this page, including links to (1) reports on audits of SFPD personnel's electronic communication devices for biased-based words, (2) SFPD's Administrative Code Sec. 96A reports on stop data, and (3) the webpage to file a complaint against an officer.

To ensure that there is ongoing evaluation of its public education campaign, the MRU's Director of Strategic Communications and its social media manager will monitor whether the public has provided any feedback on the quarterly dissemination of information on how to file a complaint against an officer. SFPD has re-evaluated its approach based on that public feedback. For example, because of a strong reaction from the public to SFPD's publishing of information on NextDoor, SFPD temporarily suspended posting information on that website in June 2020 and resumed it in September 2020 with the MRU's Director of Strategic Communications and social media manager evaluating public response. District Station Captains must also submit a memorandum to the Deputy Chief of Field Operations following their semiannual community meetings where they discuss bias-free policing. This memorandum provides the agenda of the

meeting and helps to hold the Department accountable to ensure that these community meetings are regularly taking place.

Based on the all of the above, the California Department of Justice finds SFPD in substantial compliance with this recommendation.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further. Thank you.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy (she/her)
Deputy Attorney General
Civil Rights Enforcement Section
California Department of Justice
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100
Oakland, CA 94612

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Finding # 26: There is limited community input on the SFPD's actions regarding anti-bias policies and practices.

Recommendation # 26.3 The SFPD should implement an immediate public education campaign on the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct as centered on anti-bias and the initiatives underway.

RFI- Response Date: 09/28/2020

Executive Summary:

A guiding principle of the San Francisco Police Department ("SFPD") is its commitment to treating all people with dignity, fairness and respect. It is crucial for members to carry out their duties in a manner free from bias and eliminate any perception of policing that appears biased. Biased policing is unsafe, unjust and ineffective. It also alienates the public, fosters distrust of police, and undermines legitimate law enforcement efforts.

As part of its commitment to bias-free policing, the SFPD has implemented a public education campaign informing the community on the SFPD's ongoing anti-bias initiatives focused on eliminating implicit and explicit bias in the Department. In addition, the campaign aims to educate the community about the policies and procedures for reporting biased policing. The SFPD partners with the Department of Police Accountability ("DPA") in an effort to improve the community's access to the DPA by distributing written information on how to contact them and file complaints.

Compliance Measures:

1) Immediate implementation of a public education campaign:

The SFPD implemented a public education campaign to 1) inform the community about the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct involving biased policing, and 2) educate the community on the SFPD's ongoing anti-bias initiatives aimed at eliminating implicit and explicit bias in the SFPD.

A. In December 2016, the Media Relations Unit (MRU) implemented an outreach and public information campaign (see Attachment 1 – MRU Unit Order 16-01, Public Information: Procedures for Filing Complaints of Misconduct) that includes the following protocols:

- The Risk Management Division provides annual reports to the Police Commission ("Commission") that include information on discipline cases. In practice, the Risk Management Division provides this report to the Commission on a quarterly and yearly basis (see Attachment 2 – Risk Management quarterly reports from 1st quarter 2016 through 2nd quarter 2020)
- The Risk Management Division ensures the annual reports are posted on the SFPD's webpage. (see Attachment 3 – screen shot of Commission webpage of IAD Sustained Complaints along with sampling of printouts of IAD sustained complaints by year from 2016-2020)



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- The MRU disseminates the annual report once it has been provided to the Commission using SFPD's social media accounts (See Attachment 4 – Screen shots of NextDoor, Twitter and Facebook directing the public to the Sustained IAD complaints webpage)
 - On a quarterly basis the MRU uses the SFPD's social media accounts to disseminate information advising the public how to file complaints of misconduct against officers. The information is provided in English, Spanish, and Chinese. (see Attachment 5 – copies of Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings for 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2020)
 - On a quarterly basis the MRU uses the SFPD's social media accounts to disseminate information advising the public about the SFPD's ongoing efforts to eliminate bias within the department. The information includes a link to the [SFPD's Bias-Free Policing web page](#) that provides the public with an overview of the strategies the SFPD uses to address bias. (see again Attachment 5 – copies of Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings for 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2020 and see Attachment 6 – screen shot of SFPD's Bias-Free Policing webpage)
 - MRU provides this information to the district station captains to use in their newsletters and at community meetings to inform the public about the SFPD's efforts to eliminate bias and the procedures for making complaints (see again Attachment 5 – copies of Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings for 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2020 that includes an email to district station captains.)
 - On a quarterly basis, the MRU's Director of Strategic Communications and the social media manager monitor the public's response to disseminated content and determine if changes or updates are needed. (see Attachment 7 – meeting dates and minutes detailing outcome of those meetings)
- B. In 2017, MRU created the "San Francisco's Finest" campaign designed to inform the public about the SFPD's efforts to increase trust with the community and improve transparency and accountability. (see Attachment 8 – "San Francisco's Finest" social media announcement). Addressing bias within the SFPD was part of the overall strategy to build community trust and enhance transparency and accountability. The social media campaign directed members of the public to websites where they could learn about 1) the SFPD's work on updating policies, including those addressing bias, 2) SFPD data, including sworn officer demographics, traffic stops, and officer involved shootings, and 3) how to commend an officer or file a complaint against an officer. In 2019, the SFPD discontinued the "San Francisco Finest" campaign and replaced it with the "Bias Free Policing" campaign.
- C. In 2019 with the launching of its new website, the SFPD replaced the "San Francisco's Finest" campaign with the "Bias-Free Policing" campaign, (see again Attachment 5 – copies of Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings for 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2020 that includes the Bias Free Policing materials) reaffirming the SFPD's commitment to bias-free policing. The URL on the campaign materials directs the public to the [SFPD's Bias-Free Policing web page](#) (see again Attachment 6 – screen shot of SFPD's Bias-



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

[Free Policing webpage](#)). This page provides detailed information about the SFPD's multi-pronged approach to ensuring its employees deliver unbiased, quality service to the community by using:

- Policies
- Training
- Audits
- Investigations of Biased Misconduct
- Recruitment and Hiring
- Data Collection and Analysis

The MRU disseminates the "Bias-Free Policing" campaign materials in English, Spanish, and Chinese on a quarterly basis through its social media platforms (see again Attachment 5 – copies of Quarterly Social Media and Web Postings for 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2020). The announcements include the URL directing the public to the SFPD's Bias-Free Policing page, which includes information on where the public can commend an officer or file a complaint.

- D. On December 27, 2019 the Field Operations Bureau ("FOB") issued Bureau Order 19-02 (see Attachment 9 – Bureau Order 19-02, District Captains' Bi-annual Community Meetings on Officer Contact and the Members of the Public Complaints and Commendation Process.) The SFPD's goal with this order was to standardize the way the SFPD informs the public about issues important to the communities throughout the city.

Per Bureau Order 19-02, on a semi-annual basis in the months of March and August, district station captains must present the following bias-related information at their community meetings and in their corresponding newsletters:

- Department General Order 2.04, Complaints Against Officers
- Department General Order 2.05, Citizen Complaints Against Non-Sworn Members
- Provide results of quarterly Disciplinary Review Board report as presented to the Police Commission
- Provide information on the "Know Your Rights" brochure and the Department's Whistleblower complaint process
- Provide information on where to locate reports regarding 1) Use of Force, 2) Early Intervention System, 3) Firearm Discharge Review Board, 4) Internal Affairs Division and Police Commission Sustained Complaints, and 5) Demographics of Sworn Members
- Provide general information about the investigations of Officer Involved Shooting, including the quarterly updates on OIS Investigations

On February 25, 2020, prior to the first district station community meetings in March 2020 where the above information was going to be discussed, Mayor London Breed issued the first Proclamation of Local Emergency re: COVID – 19, (see Attachment 10 –



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Proclamation of Local Emergency re: COVID – 19) limiting the number of people at gatherings. Over the next six months, Mayor Breed issued an additional 26 Supplemental Declarations limiting the number of people at gatherings. (see Attachment 11 – Supplemental Declarations #1 – #26) Because of COVID – 19 and the restrictions on the number of people at gatherings, the Deputy Chief of Field Operations waived the requirement for in-person community meetings, as such there have been no district station community meetings since February 2020. In-person community meetings will resume once the Mayor's Proclamations have been rescinded. However, district station captains continued to send out monthly newsletters in March 2020 containing information consistent with the requirements in Bureau Order 19-02. (see Attachment 12 – sampling of district station captains' newsletters)

On August 26, 2020, FOB revised Bureau Order 19-01 and re-issued it as Bureau Order 20-03 (see Attachment 13 – Bureau Order 20-03, District Captains' Bi-annual Community Meetings on Officer Contact and the Members of the Public Complaints and Commendation Process) requiring district station captains to disseminate additional information to the public regarding the SFPD's commitment to bias-free policing (**additional information in bold.**)

Per Bureau Order 20-02, on a semi-annual basis in the months of March and August, district station captains must present the following bias-related information at their community meetings and in their corresponding newsletters:

- Department General Order 2.04, Complaints Against Officers
- Department General Order 2.05, Citizen Complaints Against Non-Sworn Members
- **Explanation of the process for commending an officer for exemplary work and filing a complaint with the Department of Police Accountability**
- Provide results of quarterly Disciplinary Review Board report as presented to the Police Commission
- **Department General Order 5.17, Bias-Free Policing**
- Provide information on the "Know Your Rights" brochure and the Department's Whistleblower complaint process
- Provide information on where to locate reports regarding 1) Use of Force, 2) Early Intervention System, 3) Firearm Discharge Review Board, 4) Internal Affairs Division and Police Commission Sustained Complaints, and 5) Demographics of Sworn Members
- Provide general information about the investigations of Officer Involved Shooting, including the quarterly updates on OIS Investigations

In October 2020, per an email from the Deputy Chief of Operations, (see Attachment 14 – September 30, 2020 email from DC McEachern to district station captains) the district station captains sent out newsletters that included the required information outlined in Bureau Order 20-03. (see Attachment 15 – sampling of district station captain's newsletters). In 2021, the schedule for holding community meetings and



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

publishing newsletters consistent with Bureau Order 20-03 will revert to March and August. (see again Attachment 14 – September 30, 2020 email from DC McEachern to district station captains)

2) Publicize via multiple media the procedures for reporting bias misconduct.

The SFPD understands that it must utilize multiple mediums to disseminate information that is important to the public. The SFPD publicizes the procedures for reporting bias misconduct by using the following:

- SFPD website (see Attachment 16 – screenshot of SFPD web pages that include links for the public to file a complaint against an officer)
- Social Media postings (see Attachment 17 – screen shot of social media posting with information on how the public can commend an officer or file a complaint)
- Printed versions of the procedures on display at all ten district stations (see Attachment 18 – sampling of Bias-Free Policing campaign posted at district stations)
- DPA informational brochures prominently displayed at all district stations and department units open to the public (see Attachment 19 – sampling of DPA informational brochures prominently displayed at district stations)
- District captains' newsletters (see again Attachments 12 and 15 – district station captains' newsletters)
- SFPD 105 Reportee follow-up form, SFPD 184 Certificate of Release form, and Officers' business cards which all include URL links with information on how to file a complaint against an officer. (see Attachment 20 – copies of SFPD 105 form, SFPD 184 form and Officer business cards)

3) Publicize via multiple media the SFPD's initiatives for bias free policing.

The SFPD understands that it must utilize multiple mediums to disseminate information that is important to the public. The SFPD publicizes its initiatives for bias free policing by using the following:

- SFPD website (see again Attachment 6 – screen shot of SFPD's Bias-Free Policing webpage)
- Social Media postings (see Attachment 21 – screen shot of social media posting providing information to the public regarding the SFPD's commitment to bias-free policing)
- District captains' newsletters (see again Attachments 12 and 15 – district stations captains' newsletters)
- Commission web page (see Attachment 22 – screen shot of "Police Commission Announcement" webpage) announcing to the public the discussion and possible action on polices surrounding bias free policing:
 - Department General Order 5.15, Enforcement of Immigration Laws
 - Department General Order 5.17, Bias-Free Policing Policy
 - Department General Order 5.22, Interacting with Transgender, Gender-Variant, and Nonbinary Individuals



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- Department General Order 5.23, Interactions with Deaf & Hard of Hearing Individuals
- Department General Order 11.07, Prohibiting Discrimination, Harassment and Retaliation
- Department Disciplinary Penalty & Referral Guidelines for Sworn Members

4) Ongoing evaluation loop and audit.

The SFPD instituted the following audit and evaluation tools to determine whether its efforts to provide information to the public regarding the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct and the SFPD's anti-bias initiatives are successful:

- On a quarterly basis, the MRU's Director of Strategic Communications and the social media manager monitor the public's response to disseminated content and determine if changes or updates are needed. (see again Attachment 7 – dates of meetings with minutes detailing outcome of those meetings). As a result of these meetings, the following changes/updates were made:
 - The "San Francisco's Finest" campaign was replaced with the "Bias-Free Policing" campaign.
 - The "Bias-Free Policing" material has been programmed to automatically publish on social media platforms at regular quarterly intervals.
 - The MRU updated its Quarterly Social Media and Web Posing checklist (see Attachment 23 – updated MRU Quarterly Social Media and Web Posting checklist) to include:
 - Not on My Watch campaign material being included in quarterly release
 - Youth Know Your Rights brochure on hold due to revising of the form
 - IAD materials included in quarterly release of information
 - Social media platforms listed on the checklist
 - Postings to Nextdoor were suspended in June 2020 due to public reaction to SFPD's postings
 - Postings to Nextdoor resumed in September 2020 and public reaction will be monitored and discussed at the next MRU's Director of Strategic Communications and the social media manager's meeting
- Bureau Orders 19-02 and 20-02 (see again Attachments 9 and 13 – Bureau Orders 19-02 and 20-03, District Captains' Bi-annual Community Meetings on Officer Contact and the Members of the Public Complaints and Commendation Process) require district station captains to document in a Department memorandum to the Deputy Chief of the Field Operations Bureau ("FOB") that the community meeting regarding the policies and procedures for reporting misconduct and the SFPD's anti-bias initiatives has occurred and include a copy of the agenda. The Bureau Orders require the following auditing measures by the lieutenant assigned to FOB:
 - Track all bi-annual memoranda and agendas from district station captains to ensure the meeting occurred (see Attachment 24 – FOB Bureau Order 20-03 tracking sheet)



Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

- Track whether any community feedback was included and date feedback was provided to the Commander of Community Engagement Bureau (see again Attachment 23 – FOB Bureau Order 20-03 tracking sheet)
- Conduct annual audit of district station captains' memoranda to ensure the required information is included (see again Attachment 24 – FOB Bureau Order 20-03 tracking sheet)
- Send template with information to include for discussion for community meetings and corresponding newsletters to district station captains in January and June of each year and anytime a deficiency is found in a memorandum (see Attachment 25 – template with information to include for discussion at community meetings and in corresponding newsletter)