

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Tanya Koshy [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, January 11, 2021 1:48 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Recommendation 90.1

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Acting Captain Altorfer,

Our office has completed its review of the materials related to Recommendation 90.1 that have been submitted to us as part of the collaborative reform process. After reviewing the package and information provided by the Department, the California Department of Justice finds as follows:

Recommendation 90.1:

The SFPD should regularly and systematically capture and report the demographic composition of its supervisory, management, and senior leadership ranks to establish an ongoing mechanism to conduct comparative analyses against the overall workforce composition.

Response to 90.1:

SFPD posts demographic composition of leadership ranks in a way that is accessible to the public. In 2017, the Staff Services Division issued a Unit Order (17-03), directing the Human Resources Manager to issue a Department Statistics Report on a monthly basis, and distributes it to Staff Services, the Command Staff, and the Officer-in-Charge of the Media Relations Unit. Under the unit order, SFPD must also publish this report on its website. SFPD posts this report on its website, under the Published Reports page. The report includes racial demographics of its sworn members (i.e. the total number of members of each race or ethnicity and the percentage of the total membership that is composed of each race or ethnicity). SFPD also includes a report with more detailed demographics, showing the total number and percentage of each gender, race, and ethnicity in each rank. SFPD's package includes demographic reports from October 2020 and the California Department of Justice confirmed that SFPD provides more current demographics on its website. See SFPD Sworn Demographics by Rank <https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/2020->

[12/SFPDEEOData.20201208.pdf](#) (showing demographics as of December 8, 2020) (last visited on Dec. 13, 2020). In the latest Sworn Demographics by Rank, SFPD notes, for example, that at the Captain level, 48% of Captains are White, 8% are Hispanic, 28% are Asian, 12% are Black, and 4% are Filipino. The breakdown with both total numbers and percentages for each rank will enable SFPD to identify trends, both positive and concerning, related to diversity up the chain of command. As one example, White officers continue to be overrepresented up the chain of command; they represent just 44.45% of police officers but 62.14% of Lieutenants and 55.25% of Sergeants. The California Department of Justice recommends that SFPD update Staff Services Division Unit Order 17-03 to codify the preparation and publishing of this more detailed demographic report.

To institutionalize data collection, monitoring and analysis, SFPD created the Staffing and Deployment Unit (SDU) in 2018. The SDU is responsible for collecting and analyzing personnel data, including the demographic reports described above. The SDU maintains demographic data on a data visualization software system, which allows SFPD to create dashboards and reports on demographics and to identify trends with its personnel. The SDU meets biweekly with the Administration Bureau Command staff and as part of those meetings, it prepares reports and dashboards on personnel data, as requested by Command Staff. SFPD provided an example of one of these dashboards, which was a breakdown of the racial demographics of each Academy class from 2007-2019, which shows that the Academy class has become increasingly diverse in those thirteen years. SFPD noted that these meetings with Command Staff serve as an opportunity for leadership to review and discuss demographic data on a regular basis. The California Department of Justice recommends that in analyzing SFPD's demographics, SFPD should compare these demographics to those of the City's general population and labor force population.

Based on the all of the above, the California Department of Justice finds SFPD in substantial compliance with this recommendation.

Please let us know if you have any questions or would like to discuss this further. Thank you.

Tanya

Tanya S. Koshy  
Deputy Attorney General  
Civil Rights Enforcement Section  
California Department of Justice  
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2100  
Oakland, CA 94612

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication with its contents may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information. It is solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized interception, review, use or disclosure is prohibited and may violate applicable laws including the Electronic Communications Privacy Act. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

**Finding # 90:** The SFPD does not have representative diversity within all its ranks in the organization, especially in the supervisory and leadership ranks. Through visible, commitment to diversity at all ranks of the department, the SFPD can establish itself as a welcoming organization for all communities.

**Recommendation # 90.1** The SFPD should regularly and systematically capture and report the demographic composition of its supervisory, management, and senior leadership ranks to establish an ongoing mechanism to conduct comparative analyses against the overall workforce composition.

**Response Date:** 10/28/2020

### Executive Summary:

Since the issuance of the Collaborative Reform Initiative in October of 2016, the Department has made concerted efforts in the arena of demographic transparency. The Department is now regularly and systematically capturing and reporting the demographic composition of all ranks of the Department, including supervisory, management, and senior leadership ranks. This demographic data is collected via the Department's Human Resources Management System and is then utilized to automatically generate reports which are distributed monthly to Command Staff for review, as well as published monthly on the Department's website. This publication and distribution process has been institutionalized in Staff Services Unit Order 17-03, "Department Statistics Report Review and Distribution Procedure" (see Attachment 1, Staff Services Division Unit Order 17-03). Additionally, a supplemental report is now published in tandem with the Department Statistics Report that breaks down demographics in even greater detail, presenting both counts and percentages by race and gender for each rank.

In addition to the collection and reporting process outlined above, the Staffing and Deployment Unit, part of the Administration Bureau's Staff Services Division, was formed in April of 2018 to analyze and monitor demographics as they relate to Department personnel and staffing. The Staffing and Deployment Unit has developed interactive Tableau dashboards focused on demographic data, performed demographic time series analysis, completed demographic promotional analyses, and created a new Position Control Number system to monitor position and employee histories for the purposes of demographic trend and professional development tracking. The Staffing and Deployment Unit as well as the aforementioned initiatives have created ongoing mechanisms that allow for the conduction of comparative demographic analyses against the overall workforce composition.

Externally, SFPD has collaborated with the San Francisco Department on the Status of Women, a fellow city agency, and provided demographic data and other relevant information to support the issuance of gender analysis report. The San Francisco Department on the Status of Women issued this report, titled "Pathways to Promotion: A



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Gender Analysis of the San Francisco Police Department," in December of 2019 (see **Attachment 2**, Department on the Status of Women's "Pathways to Promotion: A Gender Analysis of the San Francisco Police Department").

Additionally, a series of meetings are held regularly to review demographic data and the associated analyses that have been conducted. These meetings are outlined in greater detail below.

### **Compliance Measures:**

#### **1) Demographic composition of supervisory, management, and senior leadership ranks captured and accessible for reporting.**

SFPD's Staff Services Division is responsible for collecting and reporting the demographic composition of all ranks of the Department on a regular and systematic basis. The data is input and maintained in the electronic Human Resources Management System (HRMS) by SFPD Human Resources upon hiring or when modifications are requested (i.e. gender change). The data includes the following categories:

- Male / Female
- White
- Black
- Hispanic
- Asian
- Filipino
- American Indian
- Other
- Unknown

From this aforementioned data collected in HRMS, a report is generated (see **Attachment 3**, Department Statistics Report – 10/5/20). This report is available in real time but is formally generated on a monthly basis by the Department's Human Resources Manager and published on SFPD's website (see **Attachment 4**, Screen Captures of SFPD.org Website and <https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/your-sfpd/published-reports/demographics>) as well as distributed to Command Staff and the Media Relations Unit. This process is formally outlined in Staff Services Unit Order 17-03, "Department Statistics Report Review and Distribution Procedure" (see **Attachment 1**, Staff Services Division Unit Order 17-03).

In an effort to improve transparency, the Department Statistics Report was improved in May of 2017 with the addition of a legend, which clarifies the civil service classifications by denoting them in plain English.



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Additionally, a supplemental report is now published in conjunction with the Department Statistics Report that breaks down demographics in even greater detail by including not only counts but percentages as well for both race and gender for each rank within the Department (see [Attachment 3](#), SFPD Sworn Demographics by Rank – 10/05/20, [Attachment 4](#), Screen Captures of SFPD.org Website and <https://www.sanfranciscopolice.org/your-sfpd/published-reports/demographics>).

The accessibility of this demographic data in HRMS has laid the foundation for multiple related analyses that are described in detail in the next section.

### **2) Establish an ongoing, repeatable process to conduct comparative analyses of data and report the results in a manner transparent to all employees and to the public.**

The ongoing, repeatable process that allows for comparative analyses of demographic data and that reports information in a manner transparent to all employees and to the public is the generation and distribution of the Department Statistics Report outlined in Staff Services Division Unit Order 17-03, "Department Statistics Report Review and Distribution Procedure" (see [Attachment 3](#), Department Statistics Report – 10/5/20 and [Attachment 1](#), Staff Services Division Unit Order 17-03). This process was created in 2017 and is executed monthly as well as on demand. In 2020, an additional report was created to supplement the Department Statistics Report and is now published in tandem with it (see [Attachment 3](#), SFPD Sworn Demographics By Rank – 10/05/20). This new report captures greater demographic detail by including percentages, not just counts, by race and gender for each rank within SFPD.

Also, in April of 2018, the Department created the Staffing and Deployment Unit (see [Attachment 5](#), Department Bulletin 18-073 – Staffing and Deployment Unit and [Attachment 6](#), PowerPoint: Overview of the Staffing and Deployment Unit (presented to newly promoted Lieutenants and Captains on 11-7-18) to be a centralized and impartial unit that collects, maintains, and analyzes personnel data and serves as a repository for such data. Through its focus on providing information to decision makers and emphasis on data driven staffing, the Staffing and Deployment Unit has worked with the Department's executive level Command Staff and SFPD Human Resources to identify the department's data needs for personnel and human resource analysis, and to implement projects to facilitate the collection and analysis of this data. The Staffing and Deployment Unit has an experienced senior analyst on staff who works with all personnel related data.

With personnel data easily accessible, it is now possible to conduct ongoing and needed barrier analyses moving forward.



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

In addition to the generation of the Department Statistics Report on a monthly and ad hoc basis, the Staffing and Deployment Unit maintains and analyzes demographic data for all ranks on a regular and ongoing basis. Specifically, the Staffing and Deployment Unit maintains historical data related to demographic trends via interactive dashboards created in the data visualization software, Tableau. One dashboard details a 10 year time series (2008-2018) of demographic breakdowns by race and by gender (see Attachment 7, Gender Breakdown by Year and Race Breakdown by Year). This dashboard can also be queried by rank and is available to Command Staff for review as needed. The Staffing and Deployment Unit will continue to add year end demographic data annually. This data allows the Staffing and Deployment Unit to conduct comparative demographic analyses year over year.

Additionally, the Staffing and Deployment Unit extracts demographic data from HRMS and combines it with rank data and assignment data (also from HRMS) via Tableau to create another interactive dashboard that Command Staff can utilize (through Tableau Reader) to glean any necessary information for staffing decisions and demographic trend analysis (see Attachment 8, Screen Capture of Race and Gender Dashboard – "Race and Gender Breakdown by Department (Sworn Full Duty Only)"). This dashboard is updated regularly on a biweekly basis.

An initial effort to track demographics as they relate to employees and assignments was undertaken at the start of this project (see Attachment 9, Active Captains' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17 and Active Lieutenants' Array – Assignment History – 9/15/17). However, this process was extremely time consuming as it had to be done manually. To rectify this issue and increase efficiency, the Staffing and Deployment Unit created and implemented a Position Control Number system in HRMS which not only allows for the tracking of assignment vacancies, but also enables the department to determine the employee history of a particular position in order to track demographic goals, and to determine the position history of a particular employee in order to track their professional development (see Attachment 10, Position Control Numbers Overview). The implementation of Position Control Numbers has automated a previously manual process and has established a method and system for continuous review and analysis.

Demographic data as it relates to promotions has also been collected and analyzed for all supervisory ranks (sergeant, lieutenant, captain, commander, deputy chief, assistant chief, and chief) by the Staffing and Deployment Unit (see Attachment 11, Promotion to Sergeant 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Sergeant 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Lieutenant 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Lieutenant 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Captain 2010-2018 by Race, Promotion to Captain 2010-2018 by Gender, Promotion to Commander 2010-2019 by Race, Promotion to Commander 2010-2019 by Gender, Promotion to Deputy Chief 2010-2019 by Race, Promotion to Deputy Chief 2010-2019 by Gender, Promotion to Assistant Chief and Chief 2010-2019 by Race, and



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

Promotion to Assistant Chief and Chief 2010-2019 by Gender). This information is maintained by the Staffing and Deployment Unit on an ongoing basis as promotions occur. This information is available to Command Staff and utilized for trend analyses.

Demographic data has already been collected, is the subject of ongoing analyses, and is being utilized by the Staffing and Deployment Unit and Command Staff via dashboards and reports for the purposes of examining and monitoring organizational diversity.

In addition to the aforementioned internal efforts, SFPD has also collaborated with the San Francisco Department on the Status of Women, an external city agency, to provide them with demographic data and other relevant and requested information to support the issuance of gender analysis report on SFPD. This report, independently authored by the San Francisco Department on the Status of Women, explores both gender and racial equity within SFPD, particularly in regards to promotions, assignments, and professional development. The report, titled "Pathways to Promotion: A Gender Analysis of the San Francisco Police Department," was issued in December of 2019 and contains a list of recommendations for how SFPD can improve equity, demographically speaking (see Attachment 2, Department on the Status of Women's "Pathways to Promotion: A Gender Analysis of the San Francisco Police Department"). SFPD is in the process of reviewing these recommendations.

### **3) Ongoing review and continuous improvement loop implemented.**

In addition to the institutionalized production and distribution of the Department Statistics Report both internally to Command Staff and all Department employees and externally to the public, the Staffing and Deployment Unit is also responsible for the collection, maintenance, monitoring, and analyses of demographic data on an ongoing basis with the goal of supporting organizational diversity and department initiatives.

The Staffing and Deployment Unit meets weekly as a team to discuss data findings, data needs, and data issues and to brainstorm solutions and goals, particularly as they relate to demographics (see Attachment 12, Example Staffing and Deployment Unit Fiscal Year 2019-20 Running Check-Ins Agenda). The Staffing and Deployment also meets biweekly with Administration Bureau Command Staff to disseminate information and problem solve (see Attachment 13, Example Bi-Weekly Staffing and Deployment Unit Meeting Agenda – 7/31/19).

Recurring bi-weekly staffing meetings with the Assistant Chiefs, Deputy Chiefs and the Staffing and Deployment Unit have also been implemented (see Attachment 14, Example Assistant Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs Staffing Meeting Agendas from February 24<sup>th</sup>, 2020, January 27<sup>th</sup>, 2020, December 30<sup>th</sup>, 2019, and December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2019). As mentioned previously, the Staffing and Deployment Unit prepares reports and



## Collaborative Reform Completion Memorandum

dashboards on personnel and human resources data for these meetings, including demographic information, vacancy information, separation information, full duty status information, assignment information, etc. These updates / discussions were previously listed as "Dashboard Updates" on the agendas but are now being listed as "Human Resources Data Dashboard Updates" for greater clarity, as well as the specific topics being discussed itemized (such as separation trends, demographic trends, full duty status trends, etc.). These meetings ultimately serve as a forum for decision-makers to convene regularly to review and discuss this demographic and other relevant data.

Also, outside of the specific meetings mentioned, the Staffing and Deployment Unit is available to Command Staff whenever human resources or staffing data questions arise that need to be answered. The availability of the Staffing and Deployment Unit in this capacity also speaks to the continuous improvement loop. For instance, hypothetically speaking, if Command Staff wanted to analyze the racial demographics of the Academy classes over the last 10 years as it compares to the current racial demographic breakdown of the overall Department as well as the racial demographic breakdown of the Department over the last 10 years, the Staffing and Deployment Unit would be able to produce relevant demographic dashboards that show that diversity is increasing in both arenas, which speaks to the fact that a more diverse group of individuals will be eligible for promotion in the years to come (see [Attachment 15](#), Academy Class Demographics: Race, Race and Gender by Unit as of 2/10/2020 (Sworn Full Duty Only, City and Airport), and [Attachment 7](#), Gender Breakdown by Year and Race Breakdown by Year). The fact that a dedicated unit exists to take responsibility for such data analyses facilitates ongoing review and a continuous improvement loop.

It is also relevant to mention that Proposition 209, also known as the California Civil Rights Initiative, was passed in 1996 and amended California's state constitution to prohibit state governmental institutions from considering race, sex, or ethnicity, specifically in the area of public employment. The legislation specifically reads that, "The state shall not discriminate against, or grant preferential treatment to, any individual or group on the basis of race, sex, color, ethnicity, or national origin in the operation of public employment, public education, or public contracting." This limits the ability of SFPD to consider demographics as a criterion for hiring or promotion. Nonetheless, SFPD now has multiple systems in place to analyze diversity in rank, assignment, and the Department overall.

The aforementioned processes and regular meetings in addition to a dedicated Staffing and Deployment Unit tasked with data collection, monitoring, and analysis ensure that SFPD is able to regularly and systematically capture and report the demographic composition of its supervisory, management, and senior leadership ranks and establishes an ongoing mechanism to conduct comparative analyses against the overall workforce composition as outlined in the recommendation at hand.